Exercise 7

Task 1

Construct an optimal binary search tree for the following elements v with probabilities $\gamma(v)$ (2 means 20% etc.).

| v | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
|-------------|---|-----|---|---|-----|
| $\gamma(v)$ | 2 | 1.5 | 4 | 1 | 1.5 |

Solution

To compute a BST with smallest weighted inner path length, we use dynamic programming. Let cost[i, j] be the weighted inner path length of the optimal BST for the node set $\{i, \ldots, j\}$ with root r[i, j].

| L / | , 0, 5 | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------|--------|-----|------|------|--------|------------------|---|---|---|---|---|
| $i \setminus j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| 1 | 2 | 5 | 12.5 | 14.5 | 18.5 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| 2 | 0 | 1.5 | 7 | 9 | 13 | 2 | | 2 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| 3 | | 0 | 4 | 6 | 10 | 3 | | | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| 4 | | | 0 | 1 | 3.5 | 4 | | | | 4 | 5 |
| 5 | | | | 0 | 1.5 | 5 | | | | | 5 |
| $\operatorname{cost}[i,j]$ | | | | | r[i,j] | | | | | | |

Initialize $\operatorname{cost}[i, i-1] = 0$, $\operatorname{cost}[i, i] = \gamma(i)$ and $\operatorname{r}[i, i] = i$. In the next step, the node with the highest weight (probability) has to be the root node, hence we can fill in the tables at position (i, i + 1). The trick in the following steps is now to pick a root, where the sum of the optimal costs of the BST for the left and the right subtree plus the total weight $\Gamma = \gamma(i) + \cdots + \gamma(j)$ is minimal (for the minimization we can ignore Γ of course). Among the optimal roots, we pick the one with the largest key (by convention).

BST of size 3: For instance (1,3); 7 + 7.5 (1) vs. 2 + 4 + 7.5 (2) vs. 5 + 7.5 (3). Hence, node 3 is at the top. For the other 2 values ((2,4) and (3,5)), we do the same.

BST of size 4: For instance (2,5); 10 + 8 (2) vs. 1.5 + 3.5 + 8 (3) vs. 7 + 1.5 + 8 (4) vs. 9 + 8 (5). Hence, node 3 is again at the top. The value (1,4) is obtained similarly.

BST of size 5: We have 13+10 (1) vs. 2+10+10 (2) vs. 5+3.5+10 (3) vs. 12.5+1.5+10 (4) vs. 14.5+10 (5). Clearly node 3 wins. The optimal BST has weighted inner path length of 18.5 and looks like this:



Task 2

Assume we want to construct an optimal binary search tree using the following greedy algorithm: Choose an element v for which $\gamma(v)$ is maximal as the root node and then continue recursively. Show that this approach does not always yield an optimal binary search tree.

Solution

Choose $\gamma_1 = \frac{1}{3} - \varepsilon$, $\gamma_2 = \frac{1}{3}$ and $\gamma_3 = \frac{1}{3} + \varepsilon$. The greedy algorithm yields a chain (3 - 2 - 1) with a weighted inner path length of

$$\left(\frac{1}{3}+\varepsilon\right)\cdot 1+\frac{1}{3}\cdot 2+\left(\frac{1}{3}-\varepsilon\right)\cdot 3=2-2\varepsilon.$$

It is better to take the tree with root v = 2 (and left child 1, right child 3). We obtain a weighted inner path length of

$$\frac{1}{3} \cdot 1 + \left(\frac{1}{3} - \varepsilon + \frac{1}{3} + \varepsilon\right) \cdot 2 = \frac{5}{3} < 2 - 2\varepsilon$$

for all $0 < \varepsilon < \frac{1}{6}$.

Task 3

Use Floyd's algorithm to compute all shortest paths in the following graph:



Solution

To use the dynamic programming approach, we compute the adjacency matrix of this graph: $\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & \infty & 2 & 2 & 4 \\ \infty & 0 & \infty & \infty & 3 \\ 1 & 3 & 0 & \infty & \infty \\ \infty & \infty & 5 & 0 & \infty \\ \infty & \infty & 6 & \infty & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

In the first step (k = 1) we consider the first row and first column of the matrix and change value A[3, 4] and A[3, 5].

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & \infty & 2 & 2 & 4 \\ \infty & 0 & \infty & \infty & 3 \\ 1 & 3 & 0 & 3 & 5 \\ \infty & \infty & 5 & 0 & \infty \\ \infty & \infty & 6 & \infty & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

We proceed with k = 2, but nothing changes. But k = 3 yields:

$$\begin{pmatrix}
0 & 5 & 2 & 2 & 4 \\
\infty & 0 & \infty & \infty & 3 \\
1 & 3 & 0 & 3 & 5 \\
6 & 8 & 5 & 0 & 10 \\
7 & 9 & 6 & 9 & 0
\end{pmatrix}$$

For k = 4 nothing changes again. Now k = 5 (last row, last column):

$$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 5 & 2 & 2 & 4 \\ 10 & 0 & 9 & 12 & 3 \\ 1 & 3 & 0 & 3 & 5 \\ 6 & 8 & 5 & 0 & 10 \\ 7 & 9 & 6 & 9 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

This is the final matrix. Every entry A[i, j] shows us exactly the shortest paths from *i* to *j*. For instance from 2 to 1 we pass by node 5 and 3 (length 3 + 6 + 1 = 10).